

# Computationally Enhanced Toolkits for Children: Historical Review and a Framework for Future Design

---

**Paulo Blikstein**  
Stanford University, USA  
paulob@stanford.edu

**now**

the essence of knowledge

Boston — Delft

# Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Human-Computer Interaction

*Published, sold and distributed by:*

now Publishers Inc.  
PO Box 1024  
Hanover, MA 02339  
United States  
Tel. +1-781-985-4510  
[www.nowpublishers.com](http://www.nowpublishers.com)  
[sales@nowpublishers.com](mailto:sales@nowpublishers.com)

*Outside North America:*

now Publishers Inc.  
PO Box 179  
2600 AD Delft  
The Netherlands  
Tel. +31-6-51115274

The preferred citation for this publication is

P. Blikstein. *Computationally Enhanced Toolkits for Children: Historical Review and a Framework for Future Design*. Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Human-Computer Interaction, vol. 9, no. 1, pp. 1–68, 2015.

*This Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> issue was typeset in L<sup>A</sup>T<sub>E</sub>X using a class file designed by Neal Parikh. Printed on acid-free paper.*

ISBN: 978-1-68083-081-1  
© 2015 P. Blikstein

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publishers.

Photocopying. In the USA: This journal is registered at the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use, or the internal or personal use of specific clients, is granted by now Publishers Inc for users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC). The 'services' for users can be found on the internet at: [www.copyright.com](http://www.copyright.com)

For those organizations that have been granted a photocopy license, a separate system of payment has been arranged. Authorization does not extend to other kinds of copying, such as that for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. In the rest of the world: Permission to photocopy must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to now Publishers Inc., PO Box 1024, Hanover, MA 02339, USA; Tel. +1 781 871 0245; [www.nowpublishers.com](http://www.nowpublishers.com); [sales@nowpublishers.com](mailto:sales@nowpublishers.com)

now Publishers Inc. has an exclusive license to publish this material worldwide. Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright license holder. Please apply to now Publishers, PO Box 179, 2600 AD Delft, The Netherlands, [www.nowpublishers.com](http://www.nowpublishers.com); e-mail: [sales@nowpublishers.com](mailto:sales@nowpublishers.com)

**Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in  
Human-Computer Interaction**  
Volume 9, Issue 1, 2015  
**Editorial Board**

**Editor-in-Chief**

**Desney S. Tan**  
Microsoft Research  
United States

**Editors**

Ben Bederson  
*University of Maryland*

Sheelagh Carpendale  
*University of Calgary*

Andy Cockburn  
*University of Canterbury*

Jon Froehlich  
*University of Maryland*

Juan Pablo Hourcade  
*University of Iowa*

Karrie Karahalios  
*University of Illinois  
at Urbana-Champaign*

Youn-Kyung Lim  
*Korea Advanced Institute of Science and  
Technology*

Nuria Oliver  
*Telefonica*

Orit Shaer  
*Wellesley College*

Kentaro Toyama  
*University of Michigan*

## Editorial Scope

### Topics

Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Human-Computer Interaction publishes surveys and tutorials on the foundations of human-computer interaction. The scope is broad. The list of topics below is meant to illustrate some of the coverage, and is not intended to be an exhaustive list.

- History of the research community
- Design and evaluation
- Theory
- Technology
- Computer supported cooperative work
- Interdisciplinary influence
- Advanced topics and trends

### Information for Librarians

Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Human-Computer Interaction, 2015, Volume 9, 4 issues. ISSN paper version 1551-3955. ISSN online version 1551-3963. Also available as a combined paper and online subscription.

Foundations and Trends® in Human-Computer  
Interaction  
Vol. 9, No. 1 (2015) 1–68  
© 2015 P. Blikstein  
DOI: 10.1561/1100000057



# Computationally Enhanced Toolkits for Children: Historical Review and a Framework for Future Design<sup>1</sup>

Paulo Blikstein  
Stanford University, USA  
paulob@stanford.edu

<sup>1</sup>This work is supported by the Stanford's Lemann Center for Educational Entrepreneurship and Innovation in Brazil.

# Contents

---

|          |   |           |
|----------|---|-----------|
| <b>1</b> | <b>Introduction</b>   | <b>2</b>  |
| <b>2</b> | <b>The Story of Microcontrollers in Education:<br/>Five Generations</b>   | <b>6</b>  |
| 2.1      | The first generation: Pioneers of physical computing<br>(LEGO/Logo, Braitenberg Bricks, and Programmable Bricks)                                    | 8         |
| 2.2      | The second generation: Conquering the World (Crickets,<br>Programmable Bricks, and BASIC Stamp)   | 13        |
| 2.3      | The Third Generation: Broadening Participation and<br>Accessing New Knowledge Domains (GoGo Board,<br>Phidgets, Wiring, and Arduino)                | 19        |
| 2.4      | The Fourth Generation: New form factors, new architec-<br>tures, and new industrial design (Pico Cricket, Lilypad,<br>Topobo, Cubelets, LittleBits) | 26        |
| 2.5      | The Fifth Generation: Single board computers<br>(Raspberry Pi, PCduino, Beagle Board)   | 34        |
| <b>3</b> | <b>A New Framework for Generative Design, or a Call for Action<br/>Against the Arduino Monoculture</b>  | <b>37</b> |
| <b>4</b> | <b>Applying the Framework to Existing Platforms</b>   | <b>42</b> |
| 4.1      | Selective exposure  | 42        |

|          |  |           |
|----------|--|-----------|
| 4.2      | Selective exposure for usability: Embedded error correction                            | 48        |
| 4.3      | Selective exposure for power: Tangibility mapping . . . . .                            | 52        |
| 4.4      | Other factors influencing selective exposure: Cost, audience, and production . . . . . | 55        |
| <b>5</b> | <b>Discussion</b>  | <b>57</b> |
| 5.1      | Children's technologies for children, or adults' technologies for children? . . . . .  | 57        |
| 5.2      | Physical computing for children: The rules of engagement .                             | 59        |
| 5.3      | A developmental trajectory, or selective unveiling . . . . .                           | 60        |
| <b>6</b> | <b>Conclusion</b>  | <b>62</b> |
|          | <b>Acknowledgements</b>  | <b>64</b> |
|          | <b>References</b>  | <b>65</b> |

## Abstract

Robotics toolkits and physical computing devices have been used in educational settings for many decades. Based on a techno-historical analysis of the development of 30 years of development of these devices, this monograph examines their design principles and presents a framework for the analysis and future design, based on the analytic construct of “selective exposure,” which examines what is foregrounded or backgrounded in hardware and software design. Selective exposure has two sub-dimensions: usability, which examines how the material communicates rules for its use, and power, which looks at how cognitive and physical operations are mapped to each other, and how the design can make these connections more explicit. I show how these dimensions crucially impact what children can achieve with these materials, and make the case for the design of toolkits in synchrony with the child’s developmental trajectory.

# 1

---

## Introduction

---

Archeologists can reconstruct a dinosaur from fragments of a bone, and biologists can infer the Earth's temperature millions of years ago by examining fragments of fossil DNA. Technology historians have also looked at details of simple machines over the millennia as a proxy for the technological level of different civilizations. Semiotics, a “science of detectives,” infers larger meaning by looking at details in language, gesture, or prosody Blikstein [1993]. When we do not have access to the entire object, but need to understand the beast, we create indirect ways to complete the puzzle. In this monograph, my goal is to historically and technologically analyze physical computing devices designed for children, derive categories of design decisions, and create theoretical and design frameworks to guide designers and researchers. This is timely, given the growing presence of these devices in formal and informal education.

The presence of several types of physical computing and robotics devices in educational settings is attributable to many research and design initiatives of the past 30 years. However, although the design of such devices has evolved significantly and their popularity has grown wildly, there is little research that examines this technology taking into

account their history and the theoretical underpinning that guided their design.

But before delving into these frameworks and devices, it is crucial to understand a few of the educational ideas that guided the pioneers in this field. As we will see throughout this monograph, much of the inspiration and early work came from Seymour Papert's research group at the MIT Media Laboratory. Before coming to MIT, Papert had worked with Jean Piaget, who was the proponent of Constructivism, a very influential theory of human cognition and development. One of the important ideas in Piaget's model is that for a child to abandon a current theory about the world, it takes more than simply being exposed to a better one. The new theory has to emerge from students' complex experiences and actions in the world. Papert added to this theory the idea that this happens more robustly if the learner is engaged in building a public, shareable "object," such as a robot or a computer program [Papert, 1980] — and called his new variation "Constructionism." In other words, Papert was very concerned with not only how to promote sophisticated ways for children to interact with the world (for new knowledge to emerge) but also in making sure that they had at their disposal rich materials and toolkits to build those sharable objects. Therefore, much of Papert's group work was about theorizing about how to create toolkits, programming languages, and other materials for children.

Papert opens his most influential book, *Mindstorms* [Papert, 1980], with an essay about the "gears of his childhood," in which he talks about how his own experience playing with gears and differentials as a young child generated a deep affective connection with multiplication tables, equations, and mathematics in general: "By the time I had made a mental gear model of the relation between  $x$  and  $y$ , figuring how many teeth each gear needed, the equation had become a comfortable friend." Papert's computational toolkits ultimately intend to create these same connections in new domains such as engineering, robotics, and cybernetics:

"A modern-day Montessori might propose, if convinced by my story, to create a gear set for children. But to hope for

this would be to miss the essence of the story. I fell in love with the gears. This is something that cannot be reduced to purely “cognitive” terms. Something very personal happened. [...] My thesis could be summarized as: What the gears cannot do the computer might. The computer is the Proteus of machines. Its essence is its universality, its power to simulate. Because it can take on a thousand forms and can serve a thousand functions, it can appeal to a thousand tastes. This book is [my attempt] to turn computers into instruments flexible enough so that many children can each create for themselves something like what the gears were for me.” [Papert, 1980]

One contribution of the current work is to identify whether and in what ways, and along what dimensions, designers of physical computing toolkits can use the principles of Constructionism in their own work.

I start the monograph by reviewing the history of microcontrollers and robotics in education, comment on their design principles and forms of interaction, and propose a set of analytic constructs to interpret design decisions. Using these constructs, I more deeply analyze representative examples to understand their affordances and usability, and finally I propose principles for theoretically-guided design. The theory I propose addresses three under-researched issues in the literature and design about the design of robotic toolkits:

- (1) What are the levels of abstraction exposed to students and what interactions do they afford?
- (2) What are the direct connections between specific design decisions and the learning goals intended for each toolkit?
- (3) How should toolkits be considered as part of a larger developmental trajectory?

To address these questions, I first divide the history of these technologies into five generations, spanning 30 years of research and development. I then propose a categorization based on the design commitments and principles of these five generations of devices, employing

the analytic construct of “*selective exposure*,” which examines what is foregrounded or backgrounded in hardware and software design (this construct will be fully explained in Section 4). Selective exposure has two sub-dimensions. Selective exposure for *usability* examines how the material communicates rules for its use — in other words, how the design embeds error correction schemes (for example, self-correcting polarity errors). Selective exposure for *power* looks at how cognitive and physical operations are mapped to each other, and how the design can make these connections more explicit so that users can exploit the full potential of the toolkits (for example, parts can be designed to explicitly show a hierarchy). Thus, selective exposure for usability guarantees a low-threshold for users to quickly start building, and selective exposure for power assures a high-ceiling by indicating through the design the more complex possibilities offered by the toolkit. Finally, I propose the idea of *selective unveiling*, a design principle which advocates the progressive exposure of layers of abstraction in synchrony with the developmental trajectory of children.

I hope that this discussion might move forward a research agenda that exposes children to the powerful ideas in several disciplines through physical computing, leading to better, more theoretically-informed designs.

## References

---

- H. Barragán. Wiring: Prototyping physical interaction design. *Interaction Design Institute*, Ivrea, Italy, 2004.
- M. Berland, 2015. Personal communication.
- I. Blikstein. Semiótica: uma ciência de...detetives. *Revista USP*, 16. pp. 161-166, 1993. <http://dx.doi.org/10.11606/issn.2316-9036.v0i16p161-166>.
- L. Buechley and M. Eisenberg. Fabric PCBs, electronic sequins, and socket buttons: Techniques for e-textile craft. *Journal of Personal and Ubiquitous Computing*, 2007.
- L. Buechley and B. Hill. Lilypad in the wild: How hardware's long tail is supporting new engineering and design communities. In *Proceedings of DIS '10*, pages 199–20. Aarhus, Denmark, 2010.
- L. Buechley, N. Elumeze, and M. Eisenberg. Electronic/computational textiles and children's crafts. In *Proceedings Interactive Design and Children '06*, pages 49–56. Tampere, Finland, 2006.
- L. Buechley, H. Perner-Wilson, and M. Satomi. Handcrafting textile interfaces from a kit-of-no-parts. In *Proceedings of TEI '11*. Funchal, Portugal, 2011.
- M. Eisenberg, A. Eisenberg, M. Gross, K. Kaowthumrong, N. Lee, and W. Lovett. Computationally-enhanced construction kits for children: Prototypes and principles. In *Proceedings of the Fifth International Conference of the Learning Sciences*, pages 23–26, 2002.
- P. Frei, V. Su, B. Mikhak, and H. Ishii. Curlybot: Designing a new class of computational toys. In *Proceedings of CHI2000*. ACM Press, 2000.

- P. Goldenberg. Fastr — a simple turtle runner, in: Logo working paper no. 30 (mit ai lab, massachussets institute of technology, cambridge, ma, usa), 1974.
- N. Granott. Microdevelopment of co-construction of knowledge during problem solving: Puzzled minds, weird creatures, and wuggles. PhD. Dissertation, Massachusetts Institute of Technology. Cambridge. <http://dspace.mit.edu/handle/1721.1/29069>, 1991.
- S. Greenberg and C. Fitchett. Phidgets: Easy development of physical interfaces through physical widgets. In *Proceedings of the 14th Annual ACM Symposium on User Interface Software and Technology*. Orlando, Florida, 2001.
- E. Hamner, T. Lauwers, and D. Bernstein. The debugging task: Evaluating a robotics design workshop. *Association for the Advancement of Artificial Intelligence*, pages 20–25, 2010.
- C. Lyon. Encouraging innovation by engineering the learning curve. Master’s Thesis, Massachusetts Institute of Technology. Cambridge, 2003.
- F. Martin. Children, cybernetics, and programmable turtles. Master’s thesis. Cambridge: Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 1988.
- F. Martin, 2013. Personal communication.
- F. Martin and A. Chanler. Introducing the blackfin handy board. *American Association for Artificial Intelligence*, 2007.
- F. Martin and L. Xu. Chirp on crickets: Teaching compilers using an embedded robot controller. In *Proceedings of SIGCSE ’06*, pages 82–86. Houston, Texas, USA, 2006.
- F. Martin, B. Mikhak, and B. Silverman. Metacricket: A designer’s kit for making computational devices. *IBM Systems Journal*, 39(3–4):795–815, 2000.
- T. McNeerney. Tangible computation bricks: Building-blocks for physical microworlds. *Proceedings of CHI 2011*, 2000.
- T. McNeerney. From turtles to tangible programming bricks: Explorations in physical language design. *Personal and Ubiquitous Computing*, 8(5):326–337, 2004. (2004/09/01) DOI = <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00779-004-0295-6>.
- S. Papert. *Mindstorms: Children, computers, and powerful ideas*. New York: Basic Books, 1980.

- R. Perlman. TORTIS — Toddler’s Own Recursive Turtle Interpreter System, in: MIT AI Memo No. 311/Logo Memo No. 9 (MIT AI Lab, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, MA, USA), 1974.
- H. Raffle, A. Parkes, and H. Ishii. Topobo: A constructive assembly system with kinetic memory. In *Human Factors in Computing (CHI) ’04*. ACM, 2004.
- J. J. Ramos, H. Azevedo, V. A. J. Vilhete, O. Noves, D. Figueiredo, L. Tanure, and F. Holanda. Iniciativa para robótica pedagógica aberta e de baixo custo para inclusão social e digital no brasil. In *Anais do VIII Simpósio Brasileiro de Automação Inteligente (SBAI 2007)*. Florianópolis, SC, 2007.
- M. Resnick and S. Ocko. LEGO/Logo: Learning through and about design. In I. Harel and S. Papert, editors, *Constructionism*, Norwood, NJ: Ablex Publishing, 1991.
- M. Resnick and B. Silverman. Some reflections on designing construction kits for kids. In *Proceedings of the 2005 Conference on Interaction Design and Children (IDC ’05)*, pages 117–122. ACM, New York, NY, USA, 2005.
- M. Resnick, F. Martin, R. Sargent, B. Silverman, R. Berg, M. Eisenberg, S. Turkle, and F. Martin. Programmable bricks: Toys to think with. *IBM Systems Journal*, 35(3–4):443–452, 1996.
- M. Resnick, F. Martin, R. Berg, R. Borovoy, V. Colella, K. Kramer, and B. Silverman. Digital manipulatives: New toys to think with. In *Proceedings of CHI ’98, (Los Angeles, April 1998)*, pages 281–287. ACM Press, 1998.
- M. Resnick, R. Berg, and M. Eisenberg. Beyond black boxes: Bringing transparency and aesthetics back to scientific investigation. *Journal of the Learning Sciences*, 9(1):7–30, 2000.
- N. Rusk, M. Resnick, R. Berg, and M. Pezalla-Granlund. New pathways into robotics: Strategies for broadening participation. *Journal of Science Education and Technology*, 17(1):59–69, 2008.
- E. Schweikardt and M. Gross. roBlocks: A robotic construction kit for mathematics and science. In *Proceedings of ICMI ’06*. Banff, Alberta, Canada, 2006.
- E. Schweikardt and M. Gross. A brief survey of distributed computational toys. *The First IEEE Intl Workshop on Digital Game and Intelligent Toy Enhanced Learning (DIGITEL ’07)*, pages 57–64, 2007.
- D. W. Shaffer and M. Resnick. “Thick” authenticity: New media and authentic learning. *Journal of Interactive Learning Research*, 10(2):195–215, 1999.
- B. Shapiro, 2015. Personal communication.

- A. Sipitakiat and P. Blikstein. Think globally, build locally: A technological platform for low-cost, open-source, locally-assembled programmable bricks for education. In *Proceedings of TEI 2010*, pages 231–232. Boston, Massachusetts, USA, 2010.
- A. Sipitakiat and N. Nusen. Robo-blocks: Designing debugging abilities in a tangible programming system for early primary school children. In *Proceedings of IDC '12*, pages 98–105, 2012.
- A. Sipitakiat, P. Blikstein, and D. Cavallo. The GoGo Board: Moving towards highly available computational tools in learning environments. *Interactive Computer Aided Learning International Conference*, Villach, Austria, 2002.
- A. Sipitakiat, P. Blikstein, and D. Cavallo. The GoGo Board: Augmenting programmable bricks for economically challenged audiences. In *Proceedings of ICLS 2004*, pages 481–488. USA, 2004.
- C. Solomon and S. Papert. Teach: A step toward more interactive programming, in: Logo working paper no. 43 (mit ai lab, massachusetts institute of technology, cambridge, ma, usa), 1975.
- B. Tinker, 2013. Personal communication.
- S. Wilson, M. Gurevich, B. Verplank, and P. Stang. Microcontrollers in music HCI instruction: Reflections on our switch to the atmel AVR platform. Paper presented at the Proceedings of the 2003 conference on New interfaces for musical expression, Montreal, Quebec, Canada, 2003.
- P. Wyeth and G. F. Wyeth. Electronic blocks: Tangible programming elements for preschoolers. In *IFIP TC. 13 International Conference on Human-Computer Interaction*, pages 496–503. IOC Press, 2001.
- O. Zuckerman, S. Arida, and M. Resnick. Extending tangible interfaces for education: Digital montessori-inspired manipulatives. In *Proceedings of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems (CHI '05)*, pages 859–868. ACM, New York, NY, USA, 2005. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/1054972.1055093>.